

COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

LAND USE AND ENVIRONMENT GROUP

Department of Planning & Development Services

Appendix A: Final Climate Action Plan Consistency Review Checklist

Introduction

The County of San Diego (County) Climate Action Plan (CAP), adopted by the Board of Supervisors on February 14, 2018, outlines actions that the County will undertake to meet its greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions reduction targets. Implementation of the CAP will require that new development projects incorporate more sustainable design standards and implement applicable reduction measures consistent with the CAP. To help plan and design projects consistent with the CAP, and to assist County staff in implementing the CAP and determining the consistency of proposed projects with the CAP during development review, the County has prepared a CAP Consistency Review Checklist (Checklist). This Checklist, in conjunction with the CAP, provides a streamlined review process for proposed discretionary projects that require environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Please refer to the County's Guidelines for Determining Significance for Climate Change (Guidelines) for more information on GHG emissions, climate change impact requirements, thresholds of significance, and compliance with CEQA Guidelines Section 15183.5.

The purpose of this Checklist is to implement GHG reduction measures from the CAP that apply to new development projects. The CAP presents the County's comprehensive strategy to reduce GHG emissions to meet its reduction targets. These reductions will be achieved through a combination of County initiatives and reduction actions for both existing and new development. Reduction actions that apply to existing and new development will be implemented through a combination of mandatory requirements and incentives. This Checklist specifically applies to proposed discretionary projects that require environmental review pursuant to CEQA. Therefore, the Checklist represents one implementation tool in the County's overall strategy to implement the CAP. Implementation of measures that do not apply to new development projects will occur through the implementation mechanisms identified in Chapter 5 of the CAP. Implementation of applicable reduction measures in new development projects will help the County achieve incremental reductions towards its targets, with additional reductions occurring through County initiatives and measures related to existing development that are implemented outside of the Checklist process.

The Checklist follows a two-step process to determine if projects are consistent with the CAP and whether they may have a significant cumulative impact under the County's adopted GHG thresholds of significance. The Checklist first assesses a project's consistency with the growth projections and land use assumptions that formed the basis of CAP emissions projections. If a project is consistent with the projections and land use assumptions in the CAP, its associated growth in terms of GHG emissions would have been accounted for in the CAP's projections and project implementation of the CAP reduction measures will contribute towards reducing the County's emissions and meeting the County's reduction targets. Projects that include a land use plan and/or zoning designation amendment that would result in an equivalent or less GHG-intensive project when compared to existing designation, would also be within the projections assumed in the CAP. Projects responding in the affirmative to Step 1 questions can move forward to Step 2 of the Checklist. If a land use and/or zoning designation amendment results in a more GHG-intensive project, the project is required to demonstrate consistency with applicable CAP measures and offset the increase in emissions as described in the Guidelines. Step 2 of the Checklist contains the CAP GHG reduction measures that projects are required to implement to ensure compliance with the CAP. Implementation of these measures would ensure that new development is consistent with relevant CAP strategies and measures and will contribute towards achieving the identified GHG reduction targets. Projects that are consistent with the CAP, as determined using this Checklist, may rely on the CAP for the cumulative impacts analysis of GHG emissions under CEQA.

A project's incremental contribution to cumulative GHG emissions may be determined to not be cumulatively considerable if it is determined to be consistent with the CAP. As specified in the CEQA Guidelines, the mere existence of significant cumulative impacts caused by other projects alone shall not constitute substantial evidence that the project's incremental effects are "cumulatively considerable" (CCR, Title 14, Division 6, Chapter 3, Section 15064[h][4]). Projects requiring discretionary review that cannot demonstrate consistency with the CAP using this Checklist may have a cumulatively considerable contribution to a significant cumulative impact and would be required to prepare a separate, more detailed project-level GHG analysis as part of the CEQA document prepared for the project.

Checklist Applicability

This Checklist only applies to development projects that require discretionary review and are subject to environmental review (i.e., not statutorily or categorically exempt projects) pursuant to CEQA. Projects that are limited to ministerial review and approval (e.g., only building permits) would not be subject to the Checklist. The CAP contains other measures that, when implemented, would apply broadly to all ministerial and discretionary projects. These measures are included for discretionary projects in this Checklist, but could also apply more broadly once the County takes action to codify specific requirements or standards.

Checklist Procedures

General procedures for Checklist compliance and review are described below. Specific guidance is also provided under each of the questions under Steps 1 and 2 of the Checklist in subsequent pages.

- The County's Department of Planning & Development Services (PDS) reviews development
 applications and makes determinations regarding environmental review requirements under CEQA.
 Procedures for CEQA can be found on the County's <u>Process Guidance & Regulations/Statutes</u>
 <u>Homepage</u>. The Director of PDS will determine whether environmental review is required, and if so,
 whether completion of the CAP Checklist is required for a proposed project or whether a separate
 project-level GHG analysis is required.
- 2. The specific applicable requirements outlined in the Checklist shall be required as a condition of project approval.
- The project must provide substantial evidence that demonstrates how the proposed project will implement each applicable Checklist requirement described herein to the satisfaction of the Director of PDS.
- 4. If a question in the Checklist is deemed not applicable (N/A) to a project, substantial evidence shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director of PDS demonstrating why the Checklist item is not applicable. Feasibility of reduction measures for new projects was assessed in development of the

- CAP and measures determined to be feasible were incorporated into the Checklist. Therefore, it is expected that projects would have the ability to comply with all applicable Checklist measures.
- 5. Development projects requiring discretionary review that cannot demonstrate consistency with the CAP using this Checklist shall prepare a separate, project-level GHG analysis as part of the CEQA document prepared for the project and may be required to prepare an Environmental Impact Report (EIR). Guidance for project-specific GHG Technical Reports is outlined in the Report Format and Content Requirements for Climate Change document, provided under separate cover. The Report Format and Content Requirements document provides guidance on the outline and content of GHG analyses for discretionary projects processed by PDS that cannot show compliance with the CAP Checklist.

Checklist Updates

The Guidelines and Checklist may be administratively updated by the County from time to time to comply with amendments to State laws or court directives, or to remove measures that may become mandatory through future updates to State or local codes. Administrative revisions to the Guidelines and Checklist will be limited to changes that do not trigger a subsequent EIR or a supplement to the SEIR for the CAP pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15162. Administrative revisions, as described above, will not require approval by the Board of Supervisors (Board). All other changes to the Guidelines and Checklist require Board approval.

Comprehensive updates to the Guidelines and Checklist will be coordinated with each CAP update (i.e., every five years beginning in 2025) and would require Board approval. Future updates of the CAP, Guidelines, and Checklist shall comply with CEQA.

	Application Information				
Contact Information					
Project No. and Name:	Chinese Bible Church				
Property Address and APN:	16919 Four Gee Rd San Diego CA 92127. APN 678-060-2				
Applicant Name and Co.:	Chinese Bible Church of San	Diego c/o F	Ron Harper		
Contact Phone:	858-449-4425	Contact Email:	harpervi@gmail.com		
Was a consultant retained to	•				
Consultant Name:	Ron Harper	Contact Phone:	858-449-4425		
Company Name:	Harper Communities Inc.	Contact Email:	harpervi@gmail.com		
Project Information					
1. What is the size of the pr	oject site (acres [gross and net])?	9.03 gros	ss. 8.32 net		
☐ Residential (indic	oposed land uses (indicate square footage [grocate # of single-family dwelling units): cate # of multi-family dwelling units):				
	te total square footage [gross and net]): te total square footage [gross and net]):	89,234 st buildir	ngs (9.03 ac. gross. 8.32 net)		
☐ Agricultural (indi	cate total acreage [gross and net]):				
☐ Other (describe):					
	the project proposed. This description should scription may be attached to the Checklist if t				
The Project would construct five	ve buildings in two phases totaling 89,234 SF of	usable space. The	buildings would consist of a		
sanctuary/administration building	(43,500 SF), education building (12,934 SF), meeting	building (5,932 SF),	fellowship hall (13,812 SF) and		
earning center (13,056 SF). Parki	ng would be provided for 417 vehicles, including 406 s	standard spaces and	11 handicap-accessible spaces.		

CAP Consistency Checklist Questions

Step 1: Land Use Consistency

For projects that are subject to CAP consistency review, the first step in determining consistency is to assess the project's consistency with the growth projections used in the development of the CAP. This section allows the County to determine a project's consistency with the land use assumptions used in the CAP.

Step 1: Land Use Consistency				
Checklist Item (Check the appropriate box and provide explanation and supporting documentation for your answer)	Yes	No		
 Is the proposed project consistent with the existing General Plan regional category, land use designations, and zoning designations? If "Yes," provide substantiation below and then proceed to Step 2 (CAP Measures Consistency) of the Checklist. If "No," proceed to question 2 below. 	X			
Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 1. The property's underlying planning entitlements allow a religious assembly with a Major Use Permit ("MUP"). The property is currently zoned S88 as a residential area in the Santa Fe Valley Specific Plan. Section 8.2 of the Specific Plan (p. 8-5 and 8-6) requires that all residential properties with "the existing S88 zone must be reclassified" to RR, RS and RV Use Regulations. All of these residential Use Regulations allow religious assembly with a MUP. The General Plan Regional Categories Map designates the project site as "Semi-Rural," and it is adjacent to 4S Ranch, which is designated as "Village." The General Plan Community Development Model asserts that "The Semi-Rural category may effectively serve as an edge to the Village, as well as a transition to the lowest-density category." The project is consistent with this concept in that it provides a lower intensity civic use adjacent to higher density residential and commercial village uses, thereby serving as an appropriate transitional land use.				
2. Does the project include a land use element and/or zoning designation amendment that would result in an equivalent or less GHG-intensive project when compared to the existing designations? If "Yes," the project must provide estimated project GHG emissions under both existing and proposed designation(s) for comparison to substantiate the response and proceed to Step 2 (CAP Measures Consistency) of the Checklist. If "No," (i.e., the project proposes an increase in density or intensity above that which is allowed under existing General Plan designations and consequently would not result in an equivalent or less GHG-intensive project when compared to the existing designations), the project must prepare a separate, more detailed project-level GHG analysis. As outlined in the County's Guidelines for Determining Significance for Climate Change and Report Format and Content Requirements for Climate Change, this analysis must demonstrate how the project would offset the increase in GHG emissions over the existing designations or baseline conditions. The project must also incorporate each of the CAP measures identified in Step 2 to mitigate cumulative GHG emissions impacts. Proceed and complete a separate project-specific GHG analysis and Step 2 of the Checklist. Refer to Section 4 of the County's Guidelines for procedures on analyzing General Plan Amendments.				
Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 2.				

Step 2: CAP Measures Consistency

The second step of the CAP consistency review is to review and evaluate a project's consistency with the applicable measures of the CAP. Each checklist item is associated with a specific GHG reduction measure(s) in the County CAP.

Step 2: CAP Measures Consistency					
Checklist Item	CAP	Yes	No	N/A	
(Check the appropriate box and provide an explanation for your answer)	Measure			,	
Step 2A: Project Operations (All projects with an operational component must fill out this portion of the Checklist)					
Reducing Vehicle Miles Traveled					
1a. Reducing Vehicle Miles Traveled					
Non-Residential: For non-residential projects with anticipated tenant-occupants of 25 or more, will the project achieve a 15% reduction in emissions from commute vehicle miles traveled (VMT), and commit to monitoring and reporting results to demonstrate on-going compliance? VMT reduction may be achieved through a combination of Transportation Demand Management (TDM) and parking strategies, as long as the 15% reduction can be substantiated.					
VMT reduction actions though TDM may include, but are not limited to: ■ Telecommuting ■ Car Sharing ■ Shuttle Service ■ Carpools ■ Vanpools ■ Bicycle Parking Facilities □ Transit Subsidies	T-2.2 and T- 2.4	X			
Shared and reduced parking strategies may include, but are not limited to:¹ ☐ Shared parking facilities ■ Carpool/vanpool-only parking spaces ■ Shuttle facilities ■ Electric Vehicle-only parking spaces					
The project may incorporate the measures listed above, and propose additional trip reduction measures, as long as a 15% reduction in emissions from commute VMT can be demonstrated through substantial evidence.					
Check "N/A" if the project is a residential project or if the project would not accommodate more than 25 tenant-occupants.					
1b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 1a. According to the Global Climate Change Analysis (August 9, 2017)					
prepared by Recon for the County of San Diego's DSEIR,					
the approved proposed Chinese Bible Church of San Diego project will reduce VMT by more than 17.8%.					
will reduce vivi1 by more than 17.6%.					

 $^{^{1}}$ Reduction actions and strategies under 1a may be used to achieve a 10% reduction in emissions from commute VMT under 2a

Step 2: CAP Measures Consistency					
Checklist Item (Check the appropriate box and provide an explanation for your answer)	CAP Measure	Yes	No	N/A	
Shared and Reduced Parking					
2a. Shared and Reduced Parking					
Non-Residential: For non-residential projects with anticipated tenant-occupants of 24 or less, will the project implement shared and reduced parking strategies that achieves a 10% reduction in emissions from commute VMT?					
Shared and reduced parking strategies may include, but are not limited to: ☐ Shared parking facilities ☐ Carpool/vanpool-only parking spaces ☐ Shuttle facilities	T-2.4			X	
☐ Electric Vehicle-only parking spaces					
Check "N/A" if the project is a residential project or if the project would accommodate 25 or more tenant-occupants.					
2b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 2a.					
Water Heating Systems			1		
Water Heating Systems 3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems					
2 1					
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be	E-1.2			X	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heaters Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater	E-1.2			X	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heater Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater Other	E-1.2			Х	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heater Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater Other Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any residential buildings.	E-1.2			X	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heater Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater Other Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any residential buildings.	E-1.2			X	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heater Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater Other Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any residential buildings.	E-1.2			X	
3a. Electric or Alternatively-Fueled Water Heating Systems Residential: For projects that include residential construction, will the project, as a condition of approval, install the following types of electric or alternatively-fueled water heating system(s)? Please check which types of system(s) will be installed: Solar thermal water heater Tankless electric water heater Storage electric water heater Electric heat pump water heater Tankless gas water heater Other Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any residential buildings.	E-1.2			X	

Step 2: CAP Measures Consis	tency			
Checklist Item (Check the appropriate box and provide an explanation for your answer)	CAP Measure	Yes	No	N/A
Water-Efficient Appliances and Plumbing Fixtures	Wicasarc			
4a. Water Efficient Appliances and Plumbing Fixtures				
<u>Residential:</u> For new residential projects, will the project comply with all of the following water efficiency and conservation BMPs ² ?				
☐ Kitchen Faucets: The maximum flow rate of kitchen faucets shall not exceed 1.5 gallons per minute at 60 psi. Kitchen faucets may temporarily increase the flow above the maximum rate, but not to exceed 2.2 gallons per minute at 60 psi, and must default to a maximum flow rate of 1.5 gallons per minute at 60 psi ³ . ☐ Energy Efficient Appliances: Install at least one qualified ENERGY STAR dishwasher or clothes washer per unit.	W-1.1			×
Check "N/A" if the project is a non-residential project.				
4b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 4a.				
Rain Barrel Installations				
Sa. Rain Barrel Installations Residential: For new residential projects, will the project make use of incentives to install one rain barrel per every 500 square feet of available roof area? Check "N/A" if the project is a non-residential project; if State, regional or local incentives/rebates to purchase rain barrels are not available; or if funding for programs/rebates has been exhausted.	W-2.1			X
5b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 5a.				

 $^{^2}$ CALGreen Tier 1 residential voluntary measure A4.303 of the <u>California Green Building Standards Code</u>. 3 Where complying faucets are unavailable, aerators or other means may be used to achieve reduction.

Step 2: CAP Measures Consistency					
Checklist Item (Check the appropriate box and provide an explanation for your answer)	CAP Measure	Yes	No	N/A	
Reduce Outdoor Water Use					
6a. Reduce Outdoor Water Use					
<u>Residential:</u> Will the project submit a Landscape Document Package that is compliant with the County's Water Conservation in Landscaping Ordinance ⁴ and demonstrates a 40% reduction in current Maximum Applied Water Allowance (MAWA) for outdoor use?					
Non-Residential: Will the project submit a Landscape Document Package that is compliant with the County's Water Conservation in Landscaping Ordinance and demonstrates a 40% reduction in current MAWA for outdoor use?	W-1.2	X			
Check "N/A" if the project does not propose any landscaping, or if the aggregate landscaped area is between $500-2,499$ square feet and elects to comply with the Prescriptive Compliance Option within the Water Conservation in Landscaping Ordinance.					
6b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 6a. Project landscape irrigation is provided by an existing well. The proposed project includes several outdoor water reduction measures including:					
a.) xeriscape planting and b.) installing weather or soil moisture based automatic irrigation system controllers and					
c.) provision of outdoor water from an existing on-site well.					
These design features are estimated to achieve at least a 40 percent reduction in outdoor water	use.				
Agricultural and Farming Operations ⁵					
7a. Agricultural and Farming Equipment					
Will the project use the San Diego County Air Pollution Control District's (SDAPCD's) farm equipment incentive program to convert gas- and diesel-powered farm equipment to electric equipment?	A-1.1			X	
Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any agricultural or farming operations; if the SDAPCD incentive program is no longer available; or if funding for the incentive program has been exhausted.					
7b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 7a					

⁴ http://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/cob/ordinances/ord10427.pdf.
⁵ Existing agricultural operations would not be subject to questions 7 and 8 of the Checklist, unless a proposed expansion is subject to discretionary review and requires environmental review pursuant to CEQA.

Step 2: CAP Measures Consistency					
Checklist Item (Check the appropriate box and provide an explanation for your answer)	CAP Measure	Yes	No	N/A	
8a. Electric Irrigation Pumps					
Will the project use SDAPCD's farm equipment incentive program to convert diesel- or gas-powered irrigation pumps to electric irrigation pumps?	A-1.2			X	
Check "N/A" if the project does not contain any agricultural or farming operations; if the SDAPCD incentive program is no longer available; or if funding for the incentive program has been exhausted.					
8b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 8a.					
Tree Planting					
9a. Tree Planting					
Residential: For residential projects, will the project plant, at a minimum, two trees per every new residential dwelling unit proposed?	A-2.1			X	
Check "N/A" if the project is a non-residential project.					
9b. Project Detail: Please substantiate how the project satisfies question 9a.					